



International
Labour
Organization

► Evaluation Office



i-eval Discovery



Decent Work in Jordan's Floriculture Sector – Independent Final evaluation

QUICK FACTS

Countries: Jordan

Evaluation date: 30 November 2022

Evaluation type: Project

Evaluation timing: Final

Administrative Office: RO/DWT-Beirut

Technical Office: RO/DWT-Beirut

Evaluation manager: Hiba, Al Rifai

Evaluation consultant(s): Ms. Svetlana Bronyuk (team leader, international consultant),
Mr. Ahmed Tamimi (national consultant)

DC Symbol: JOR/19/02/AUS

Donor(s) & budget: Australia/DFAT, US\$ 2,394,539

Key Words: Decent work; employment; youth employment; formal employment; women employment; disability inclusion; green jobs



BACKGROUND & CONTEXT

Summary of the project purpose, logic and structure

Current evaluation exercise is a Final Independent Evaluation of the ILO Project “Decent work in the floriculture sector in Jordan”. The Project adapted and piloted a compliance model to the floriculture subsector, addressing decent work deficits. At the same time, it launched skills training and worked closely with international sectoral and export specialists to enhance firm-level productivity and access to new market opportunities. Expected Project’s outcomes:

Outcome 1: Improved employability of 1000 Syrian refugees and vulnerable Jordanians in Madaba, Irbid, and Balqa governorates.

Outcome 2: Improved working conditions and enhanced compliance with national legislation and International Labour Standards on target farms

Outcome 3: Increased local capacity (knowledge and expertise) in multiple levels of the floriculture value chain.

The project is led by the Chief Technical Adviser (CTA) of ILO’s Programme of Support to the Crisis Response, with support from a national project coordinator, a national M&E Officer, a national Admin and Finance Officer. Programme and M&E backstopping is provided by the Regional Programming Unit within ROAS and relevant DWT specialists. The project is funded by the Government of Australia represented by the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT). The budget of the project is US\$ 2,394,539. The project was signed on 1st July 2019 and ended on 31st October 2022.

Present situation of the project

The project builds on a larger agriculture intervention launched by the ILO, with support from the Kingdom of the Netherlands, in 2018.

The project adapted Better Work Jordan monitoring and advisory tools to enhance compliance with labour standards in the agriculture sector. It also established a Tripartite Working Group to negotiate, draft and endorse bylaws for agriculture workers, under the labour code. Under the project, the ILO in Jordan established networks with farmers and industry associations which provide an organizing block for workers and employers in the sector. Ultimately the project sought to influence a more productive and socially just floriculture sector through investing in the development of workers’ skills with a



	<p>view to improve their employability and value in the floriculture labour market.</p>
<p>Purpose, scope and clients of the evaluation</p>	<p>The main purpose of this independent final evaluation is to provide an independent assessment of the progress to date for accountability and learning purposes, through an analysis of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, effects and orientation to impact of the project. The exercise is conducted in line with the ILO Evaluation Policy Guidelines: ILO Policy Guidelines for results-based evaluation and the UN Norms and Standards for Evaluation.</p> <p>The evaluation scope covered the whole project period from the start on 1 July 2019 until the end of the Project, 31 October 2022. The evaluation integrated gender equality, disability inclusion and other non-discrimination issues as a cross-cutting concern throughout its methodology, analysis and deliverables. Gender concerns were addressed in accordance with the ILO Guidance note 4, “Integrating gender in monitoring and evaluation of projects”. The findings of the evaluations and its recommendations will be used by the ILO and its stakeholders to enhance organizational learning</p>
<p>Methodology of evaluation</p>	<p>The evaluation applied a mixed-method approach, with the main focus being on the qualitative techniques, including quantitative data obtained through the review of the project documents and reports and video materials produced by the Project. The primary data was collected directly from the stakeholders through individual and group interviews conducted with the stakeholders via virtual and in-person mode. The focus group discussions were held with the project’s beneficiaries – represented by the trainees and workers (Syrian and Jordanian men and women) and the farmers (men mostly as there are no farm owners in Jordan who are women).</p> <p>Project reports and documents as well as key policy papers and country strategic plans and research reports were analysed as secondary data sources. The evaluation applied the OECD/DAC evaluation criteria of relevance, coherence, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and impact potential.</p> <p><i>Major limitations encountered:</i></p>

1. The data collection process conducted in a distant mode was challenged by the fact that the possibility to hold interviews online resulted in several postponements which increased the duration of the data collection phase.
2. The focus groups with the beneficiaries didn't foresee the transportation for the participants, thus the planned number of the participants could not be met. In order to ensure the sufficient number of voices of beneficiaries, the evaluators conducted individual interviews on the phone

MAIN FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS

Main Findings:

Relevance, coherence and strategic fit: Strategic relevance of the project has been rated as high by all key stakeholders and constituents who confirmed great importance of the project to the overall importance of creating decent work opportunities for vulnerable groups of population including women, youth, Syrian refugees and persons with disabilities. The project is well-aligned with countries' national priorities, strategies and plans such as Jordan Vision 2025, ILO Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP), Jordan Response Plan (JRP) for the Syria Crisis 2020-2022, National Strategy for women in Jordan 2020-2025, United Nations Sustainable Development Framework (UNSDF), National Framework on Child Labor, and others.

Validity of Design: The project's design is based on the Results Based Management approach (RBM). Overall project's design including the project's major desired Outcomes is logical and coherent. The outcome level results and major outputs address the ILO cross cutting issues to a high extent through the gender-sensitive, disability inclusive and environmentally sustainable activities and human-centered indicators. The Project design benefitted from the Needs Assessment and Vulnerability study which informed future interventions.

Effectiveness: The Project provided technical support and resources to support the employability of vulnerable groups of population through expansion of employment opportunities for women and persons with disabilities. Social dialogue fostered by the Project set

the ground for improvement of the regulatory framework in the agriculture sector with the high share of informal economy. The unified contract for Jordanian and non-Jordanian workers, training on OSH for workers and the employers, and training of labour inspectors in the agriculture sectors are the major results contributing to decent work in the floriculture sector. The project achieved the targets almost across all desired outcomes except for the targets related to the job matching of persons with disabilities. Total number of people matched with jobs is 116 (70% female, 30% male), out of them 81% are Jordanians and 19% are Syrians. Only 2 persons with disabilities (male Syrians) were matched with jobs.

Efficiency of resource use: Overall implementation of the project was delayed for almost a year due to the challenges in hiring the CTA and the effects of the COVID-19 which postponed the start of the training component of the project. The time resources allocated for the outcome 3 were not enough to manage for results in a more strategic way. The project demonstrated efficiency in strategic use of resources through gender-sensitive budgeting and environmental sustainability approach through allocation of specific funds to support farmers in creating green jobs. The project lacked sufficient financial resources to support the employability of persons with disabilities in a more targeted way.

Impact Orientation and Sustainability: the project impacted the floriculture sector of Jordan by creating the pool of skilled workers represented by Syrian refugees and vulnerable Jordanians, including men, women, and persons with disabilities. The Project achieved the results with high sustainability and impact orientation to decent work – training workers on OSH in the floriculture sector, developing unified contract for Jordanian and non-Jordanian workers, preparing the ground for enhancing compliance practices in the sector. The knowledge generated by the Project opens export opportunities for local farms with future potential to the creation of new green jobs. The investment of the Project in the farms assets demonstrated strong impact orientation towards gender equality, environmental sustainability and disability inclusion.

Conclusions:

Overall, this intervention impacted the floriculture sector of Jordan by

creating the pool of skilled workers represented by Syrian refugees and vulnerable Jordanians, including men, women, and persons with disabilities. The Project demonstrated strong impact orientation towards gender equality, environmental sustainability and disability inclusion and contributing to the achievement of the SDGs 1, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 8.

RECOMMENDATIONS, LESSONS LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES

Main findings & Conclusions

Main recommendations and follow up:

- 1. To the Project Team.** To consult with the ACTEMP at DWT/Beirut on current opportunities for JCFA members to undergo the ILO In Business Programme and other trainings developed by the ILO ITC Training Centre for employers' organizations to be undertaken by JCFA management on design and promoting new services for its members
- 2. To the DWT/Beirut.** To conduct consultations with the tripartite constituents and the potential donors on the development of the second phase intervention aimed at scaling up current activities through engaging other farms in the floriculture sector to promote decent work and create green jobs for Syrian refugees, vulnerable Jordanians (women in vulnerable situation, youth in NEET), persons with disabilities (men and women) and migrant workers (men from Egypt)
- 3. To the JCFA.** To build on achieved results and support their members in delivering new services through trainings, outreach campaigns and dissemination of the developed materials to promote growth of the floriculture sector and decent work opportunities for men and women, including persons with disabilities. To utilize the created e-platform by helping farmers meeting skilled workers trained by the Project.
- 4. To the DWT/Beirut.** To continue advocacy efforts in Jordan in promoting ratification of the governance convention C129, explaining the importance for tackling challenges of informality along with the adherence to the fundamental conventions already ratified by Jordan and enhancing better understanding of the Recommendation No. 204 on Transition from the Informal to the Formal Economy.

5. To the farmers (employers) in the floriculture sector. To create career development opportunities for men and women working in the floriculture sector to allow their personal and professional growth and increase of income (strong recommendation from workers - 15 JD per day)

6. To the GFJTU. To build on achieved results to continue work with the Labour Management Committees on expanding and strengthening the unionization of workers within the floriculture sector giving special attention to women working in the sector and persons with disabilities (men and women).

7. To the government, Ministry of Labour and/or the donors. To introduce wage-subsidies and micro-grants to the employers in the agriculture sector aimed at widening accessibility of the farms for persons with disabilities (men and women), creating decent jobs for PwDs (men and women) and starting floriculture business for men and women.

8. To the government, Ministry of Agriculture and/or the donors. To introduce micro-credits with low or zero interest rates and micro-grants for farmers with alternative types of affordable collateral (guarantees) in the agriculture sector to pilot environmentally friendly technologies – hydroponic, solar energy, better water management and green recycling.

Main lessons learned and good practices

Lessons learnt:

Lesson learnt 1. Increasing employability of persons with disabilities in floriculture sector requires careful analysis of risks and hazards at the workplace, analysis of suitability of certain occupations for persons with disabilities with certain abilities and analysis of the accessibility of the workplace.

Lesson learnt 2. Enhancing employability of persons with disability requires supporting the employers in enhancing the accessibility of the workplace, in training supervisors of persons with disabilities on possible risks and hazards for PwDs at the workplace and in finding the operations which could be performed by PwDs at certain workplace.



Lesson learnt 3. Establishing WASH facilities for women at the farms increases willingness of women to invest more hours in work.
Lesson learnt 4. Women in Jordan do not mind working with men at the same workplace, provided that they have gender-sensitive working environment.

Emerging good practices:

Best practice 1. Provision of the farms with environmentally friendly facilities aimed at better utilization of natural resources leads to saving operation costs which could be invested by the farmers into creation of green jobs.

Best practice 2. Holding floriculture trainings in the farms accompanied by the daily allowances, transportation and food allowed representatives of the vulnerable groups to concentrate on learning and develop good theoretical and practical skills.