



EU/ILO collaboration in the monitoring of labour aspects in the implementation of the EU's rules of origin initiative for Jordan, Phase II - Final Independent Evaluation

ILO TC/Symbol:	JOR/18/54/EUR
Type of Evaluation:	Independent Final Evaluation
Evaluation timing:	October 25th, 2022, to February 28th, 2023
Project Countries:	Jordan
P&B Outcome:	Outcome 3
SDG under evaluation:	SDG #8 – Decent Work and economic growth
Evaluation completion date:	May 15 th , 2023
Administrative Office:	Regional Office for the Arab States (ROAS)
Technical Office:	Better Work Jordan; Decent Work Technical Team Response to Syrian Crisis
Evaluation manager:	Hnin Wuit Yee
Evaluation office oversight:	Naomi Asukai
Evaluation consultant(s):	Jacqueline Yiptong Avila (International Consultant) Qasem Newashi (National consultant)
Evaluation Budget:	\$17, 550 USD
Donor(s) & budget:	European Union Euro 4,444,444.00
Keywords:	Decent work, Economic and social development; Employment creation; Employers: Capacity Building; Employment service; Government: Capacity Building; Labour inspection; Labour standard; Skills Development; EU Export Certification

This evaluation has been managed according to ILO's evaluation policies and procedures. This report has not been professionally edited, but it has undergone quality control by the ILO Evaluation Office. Due to lack of adherence to methodological rigor in some sections, the ILO Evaluation Office has made minor revisions to the report. Certain text has been removed or edited and additional stakeholders' inputs have been added in a box. Despite discussions to find common understanding on the issues, it was not possible to find mutually acceptable language and the evaluation team has a dissenting opinion on the changes. Findings nor conclusions have been substantially changed and a document trail has been maintained on the matter. For further information, please refer to the Director of the Evaluation Office at [EVAL@ilo.org](mailto: EVAL@ilo.org).

BACKGROUND & CONTEXT

Summary of the project purpose, logic, and structure

The war in Syria has caused millions of people to flee for their lives. The international community has tried to meet refugee needs and provide host countries with assistance and resources to protect refugees. In February 2016, the European Union (EU) and the Government of Jordan (GoJ) signed the Jordan Compact to address the impact of the Syria conflict and the subsequent Syrian refugee crisis in this country. The EU and Jordan have a strong partnership across many sectors and since 2002, they are linked by an Association Agreement. On the 19th of July 2016, the 10th EU-Jordan Association Committee adopted a simplification of the EU Rules of Origin (RoO), to encourage Jordanian exports to the EU in view of enhancing investments and to create job opportunities in the Jordan's formal sector for both Jordanians and Syrians. The 10-year simplified RoO initiative for Jordan also known as the Relaxed Rules of Origin, is a component of the EU's broader response to the ongoing Syria crisis. It is applicable to a list of 50 industrial products manufactured in 18 designated zones across Jordan; the list includes apparel, electric and electronic appliances, cables, furniture, buses, cement, precious metals, paints, cosmetics, cleaning agents and soaps, chemicals, stone and marble, and plastics. To benefit from the RoO, factories are required to employ no less than 15% of Syrian refugees in the first two years with this percentage raising to 25% in the third year of the simplified RoO program. In response to the simplified RoO initiative, the Ministry of Labour (MOL), the EU and the International Labour Organization (ILO) signed a collaboration agreement to support the implementation of the scheme while safeguarding decent working conditions in companies exporting to the EU.

In May 2017, the EU and the ILO signed an Memorandum of Understanding for the Project "EU/ILO collaboration in the monitoring of labour aspects in the implementation of the EU's rules of origin initiative for Jordan" referred in this report as the EU/ILO Project. The Project was built on existing cooperation between the ILO and the MOL in partnership with national stakeholders and the private sector to strengthen the capacity of the factories for compliance with International Labour Standards as well as Occupational Safety and Health requirements. The Project also facilitated the creation of decent work for Jordanians, Syrians, and migrants working in factories registered in the RoO program. During the first phase of the project which ended at the end of November 2018, ILO designed an overall framework for

	<p>providing support, monitoring, and technical assistance to the MOL and enterprises that wished to benefit from the simplified RoO and to export to the EU countries. At the end of 2018, a cost extension was granted by the EU for Phase II with a duration of 48 months ending on November 30th, 2022.</p> <p>In Phase II, the ILO scaled-up the work that was previously done during Phase I, with the objective to further advance the opportunities of RoO registered companies. ILO Better Work Jordan (BWJ) is a partnership between the UN’s International Labour Organization (ILO) and the International Finance Corporation (IFC), a member of the World Bank Group that was created in 2009. During Phase II, BWJ extended its services developed by the Better Work Global Programme for the Jordanian garment industry to three non-garment industries: plastics, chemicals, and engineering.</p> <p>The role of BWJ is to engage with workers, employers, and governments to improve working conditions and boost industry competitiveness. It offers a core service program that assesses, advises, and trains factories ensuring that they are complying to Jordanian labor laws and international standards which are pre-requisite for exporting goods to the EU countries. BWJ has adapted its garment Better Work’s Compliance Assessment Tool (CAT) used by Better Work Enterprise Assessors (EA) to assess compliance in the garment industry for the non-garment sectors. It also introduced the approach and methodology of the CAT to the MOL Labour Inspectors, training them to assess factories, advise, and train the middle management and workers in in the factories.</p> <p>Since the simplified RoO requires companies to hire Jordanians and a specific percentage of Syrian refugees, the Project supported the Syrians in obtaining work permits while implementing a job matching program with factories for jobseekers. The Project funded 5 Employment Services Centers (ESC) where Outreach and Employment Officers trained by ILO, helped the jobseekers to find work at factories registered with the ESC while using an E-Counselling system developed with the EU funding.</p>
Present situation of the project	Phase II of this EU/ILO collaboration project came to an end in November 2022. A no cost extension agreement has been signed allowing the project to continue until the 27 th of March 2023.
Purpose, scope, and clients of the evaluation	The purpose of this Evaluation is to assess the overall achievements of Phase II against its planned outcomes and outputs to generate lessons learned, best practices and recommendations. The evaluation period corresponds to the Phase II lifecycle from December 2018 to November 2022. Information consulted and analyzed for this evaluation in this report is limited to the data available at the time of drafting of this report. This included project performance quarterly and annual reports as well as data from 2019

to the end of November 2022. The 2022 third quarter and the Annual 2022 reports were not available at the time.

The geographic coverage of the EU/ILO Project are the areas serviced by the ESCs. In the north these are the Mafrq governorate (ESC Za'atari Camp and Mafrq city); in the south, the Irbid governorate (ESC Al Hassan) and in the middle region of Jordan, the Zarqa Governorate (ESC Zarqa) and the Amman Governorate (ESC Sahab). In its methodology, analysis and deliverables, the Evaluation has integrated cross-cutting themes that include gender equality, inclusion of people with disabilities, environmental sustainability, International Labour Standards, and social dialogue, as well as Covid-19.

The primary clients of this Evaluation are ILO, the Ministry of Labour, the Ministry of Industry, Trade and Supply (MOITS), private sector employers, the Jordan Chamber of Industry, the General Federation of Jordanian Trade Unions (GFJTU), the garment and non-garment sector trade unions, the European Union as well as the ILO implementing partners. Secondary users include project stakeholders that may indirectly benefit from the knowledge generated by the evaluation including UN agencies, IFC, international and national organizations that are responding to the Syrian crisis.

Methodology of the evaluation

This evaluation has examined the extent to which the different project milestones were achieved; the desired outputs, and expected outcomes realized. It has identified strengths and weaknesses in the project design, strategy, and implementation as well as lessons learned with recommendations. Furthermore, it has touched upon cross cutting issues such as gender equality, disability, social dialogue, environmental sustainability, international standards, and covid-19 in terms of challenges and opportunities for tackling the most vulnerable target populations in line with the guidelines and protocols set by the ILO Evaluation Office.¹

The Evaluators have used a participatory and mixed-methods approach in designing this utilization-focused evaluation. During the Inception Phase, they consulted with ILO staff when finalizing the evaluation questions and sub-questions, discussing challenges and issues regarding the selection of informants. The interviews and group discussions were conducted using the Appreciative Inquiry approach where the questions focused on instances of success, peak experiences, values and wishes. ILO staff has facilitated the planning of the data collection; however, the Evaluators have conducted the data collection and analysis independently.

¹ ILO policy guidelines for results-based evaluation: Principles, rationale, planning and managing for evaluations. 4th edition, November 2020.

The evaluation questions have been addressed using multiple lines of evidence, combining primary qualitative data with information gathered from the document review of the project and initiatives similar to the EU/ILO project as well as an internet research. The findings and conclusions result from the triangulation of information gathered from these different sources. The Evaluators have made judgments based on multiple channels of evidence and their analysis was guided by the requirements of the Term of Reference (TOR).

The National Evaluator conducted interviews in person and by phone as well as small group discussions with representatives from the MOL, the MOITS, the Jordan Chamber of Industry, members of the Petrochemical Trade Union and General Trade Union of Workers, factory managers, ESC service providers, MOL Labour Inspectors, the implementing partners, and jobseekers. Interviews with key informants were performed remotely. A total of 75 hours of interviews were conducted with 73 informants.

During the Inception Phase, the Evaluators have identified mitigation strategies to address limitations and constraints of the methodology and data collection. The limitations of this study include the following: 1) not all interviews were conducted in persons; several were conducted remotely by phone and on the Zoom platform 2) The Evaluators have initially considered conducting Focus Group Discussions (FGD) of factory workers hired as a result of placements through the ESC job matching process. However, this was deemed to be unfeasible since the workers could only be met at the factory during their working hours, which would have been disruptive to all concerned. 3) The Evaluators also considered including persons with disabilities in the study, but resource and time limit constraints limited the scope of the data collection in terms of locating and visiting the informants. 4) The number of jobseekers interviewed was limited.

MAIN FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS

Relevance and strategic fit

The Jordan's economy had been struggling with persistently sluggish growth dynamics and structural challenges even prior to the Covid-19 crisis. The current unfavorable global context poses further risks to the Jordanian economy. To fulfill the RoO requirements regarding the employment of Syrians refugees, the Jordanian government started issuing work permit to Syrian refugees. The Project connected the Syrian work permit applicants to the guidance support offices of GFJTU. The MOL and GFJTU are the only entities that can issue work permits to the Syrians. The Evaluation found that helping the jobseekers find work through a job matching process at the factories registered with the ESC is relevant in this context. Registration for the simplified RoO takes place at the MOITS; the registered factories are encouraged but are not obligated to enroll in BWJ core service program. The Evaluation

found that the objectives of the Project are aligned with the framework of the ILO Decent Work Country Project of Jordan (2018-2022), the 2018-19 ILO's Project and Budget (P&B), and the SDG 8. Furthermore, the EU/ILO Project is aligned with the priorities of the EU in Jordan.

Validity of Design

During its analysis phase, the Evaluation found and concluded that there are two distinct projects in EU/ILO Project agreement: **Outcome 1** supports the Jordanian and the Syrian job seekers in finding work in companies that are exporting to the EU under the simplified RoO while **Outcome 2** assists and monitors factories in the garment, chemical, engineering, and plastic in the implementation of decent work conditions, in view of satisfying the export requirements to the EU. The two outcomes have different target populations: for Outcome 1, they are jobseekers while Outcome 2 targets factories registered for the RoO. The Evaluation also found that the activities of Outcome 1 and Outcome 2 are not connected nor related. In addition, the training program in Outcome 1 targets the ESC service providers while Outcome 2 aims at building capacity among the MOL Labour Inspectors, middle management, and workers in the factories. Furthermore, the projects are managed independently: Outcome 1 is part of the ILO Response to the Syrian Refugee Crisis Programme while Outcome 2 is managed by Better Work Jordan.

The Evaluation could not explain why this project was designed in this two-in-one fashion. It identified several issues with the single Logic Model that addressed Outcome 1 and Outcome 2. In some instances, it was not possible to identify links between the activities and their expected output. The Evaluation found that syntaxes used to describe the project outputs and outcomes were incorrect. The Evaluation found that the limited number and type of performance indicators restricted the monitoring of the EU/ILO program. The incomplete Logic Model or Theory of Change and the absence of assumptions constrained the function of this Evaluation in the assessment of the results and influence of this Project on its beneficiaries.

Efficiency

Outcome 1: In terms of job placement and referrals, data from the Project reports showed that the program targets were exceeded. The Project has encouraged the hiring of women, and the placement numbers are high especially for Syrian women whose placement rate in 2022 was as high as 96%. Nevertheless, job seekers faced many challenges. Elderly people for example, are often perceived as incapable of handling the pressure of factory environments, hence they had difficulty in being hired just as people with disabilities. Informants explained that these people are often hired but laid off shortly after because the workplace does not wish or cannot

accommodate their needs; else the person resigned, discouraged by the demand of the job and management. The Project did not quantify this situation since it did not collect data for the calculation of job retention rates. It was also noted that not all Syrian refugees are willing to obtain a work permit since formal employment requires that they contribute towards social security which will reduce their income. There is also fear among some Syrians that formal remunerated employment may take away their eligibility for cash and voucher assistance programs established in response to the Syrian crisis by various aid organizations. Given that the job market is unstable and there is competition between Syrians and Jordanians at the workplace, many prefer to stay in social assistance that provides some security while working in the informal sector.

In 2019, ILO advertised that it has launched the first online job counselling and guidance platform in Jordan². The purpose of this platform was to offer workers improved access to job and training opportunities across multiple sectors through job-matching service and career guidance. The Evaluation has received contradictory information on the performance of this system. The intended users of the system, which include ESC service providers, jobseekers, and factory managers, reported that they do not use this system which they do not find user-friendly. However, the Project reports that the system is utilized; it is able to provide data on the number of jobseekers who received service at the ESCs. There were 21,357 persons served from the beginning of Phase II to the 3rd quarter of 202. During this period, 15,124 referrals took place and 10,457 people found jobs. It appears that the Platform is used by the ESC service providers only; they first enter information by hand on paper forms then input the data on the platform.

The Evaluation noted that the Project had initially planned to collaborate with the MOL in the development of a National Employment Platform. The Evaluation revealed that with the collaboration of the Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit GmbH (GIZ), MOL has developed Sajjil³ which like the ILO E-Counselling platform aims at facilitating job search for individuals and helping employers find qualified people; it also offers training opportunities. At the beginning of 201, ILO and MOL held initial discussions on how to manage platform and the ILO E-Counselling platform complement each other, but these discussions did not lead to a common E-Counselling platform. The Project Team has pointed out that the MOL system has been designed for Jordanian jobseekers only and not for Syrians and other foreign workers. The Evaluation did not find documentation that explains the purpose and objectives of the E-Counselling Platform. It questioned if ILO has adequately and sufficiently promoted the

² https://www.ilo.org/beirut/information-resources/factsheets/WCMS_671350/lang--en/inde

³ <https://sajjil.gov.jo/>

design of a unique E-Platform to serve the needs of the organization and MOL.

The ESC Employment and Outreach officers have been trained with the overall objective of enhancing the quality and efficiency of the delivery of employment services. This activity was outsourced to Amideast, a leading American nonprofit organization engaged in international education, training, and development activities in the Middle East. The ESC service providers reported that although they were satisfied with the training methodology of Amideast, they did not learn much that can be applied to their work. In fact, the service provider explained that ILO was unclear about the objectives of the training and that developing the course content was challenging. The Amideast progress report of 2021 supported these findings; it outlined some of the issues with the design and provided recommendations for future training. The Evaluation also found that the training was not reserved for the staff of the ESC funded by the EU/ILO Project, but other individuals were invited by ILO to attend.

Outcome 2: To date, nineteen companies have registered in the simplified RoO program; of these thirteen have taken part in the non-compulsory BWJ program. Since Outcome 2 depends on the number of enterprises that register in the simplified RoO, at the beginning of the program, no target was set for how many companies that the EU/ILO project should reach; instead, Outcome 2 had a rolling target. It should be noted that companies can remove themselves from the simplified RoO program at any time.

Effectiveness

Outcome 1: The Project report showed that the ESC service providers were effective in enlisting employees and identifying vacancies, matching the jobseekers with a job 70% of the time. However, given that the monitoring system does not collect details on employers, it was not possible to identify the employment sectors where this project has been most effective in matching jobs and jobseekers. With regards to gender, out of the 21, 357 jobseekers, 70% of them were men and 30% women. According to the Project report, the project exceeded its target of 9 000 jobseekers that found a job through the ESC. Analysis performed by the Evaluation shows that the number of jobseekers visiting the ESC has declined since 2020. This drop was inevitable due to the Covid-19 pandemic. However, this number has not returned to the 2019 level after the pandemic restrictions were lifted.

The analysis also showed that the percentage of jobseekers who received a referral has increased since 2022. It appears that Syrian women have been referred over 80% of the time. But the percentage of Syrian men referred to the factories is fewer than 50%. The data shows that over the 4 years, there was a gradual increase in the number of referrals that found work in a factory; the referral rate is

on average, 70 percent. In 2021 and 2022, over 95% of the Syrian women were successful in finding a job compared to 61% of Jordanian women. Lack of data did not allow for the calculation of job retention rates among the Jordanian and Syrian jobseekers who had a referral and a job offer through the ESC.

Outcome 2: At the time of this evaluation, nineteen companies were registered in the simplified RoO program. All informants expressed disappointment with this low registration figure. The reasons received to explain the low enrolment include 1) Limited capacity of factories to increase production; 2) Lack of interest in exporting; 3) Lack of knowledge of the EU market; 4) No contact with European importers; 5) Visa restrictions for Jordanians and Syrians to enter European countries; 6) Additional monetary requirements such as registration fees for the simplified RoO program. BWJ has explained that it is not within its mandate to promote the RoO, it only provides its services to the registered companies. Nevertheless, the Evaluation is of the opinion that the RoO registration can improve if BWJ works more closely with the stakeholders including the Ministry of Industry, Trade and Supply and the Jordan Chamber of Industry while showcasing the registered RoO companies that are receiving BWJ support.

The Evaluation received positive feedback from the factory managers regarding the core services provided by BWJ. They reported having a positive working relationship with the BWJ team. The capacity building program for the Labour Inspectors also received good reviews. The Evaluation found that the Project conducted its activities effectively and the presence of experienced BWJ staff on the Team was beneficial to this project.

Mitigation of Covid-19

The project has not received extra funds for the COVID-19 mitigation. According to the Project reports, since job matching, placements and operations could not take place at the ESCs, the project took the opportunity to conduct on-line capacity building sessions for all ESC service providers on career counselling. A new initiative titled “*Regional Employment Services*” was created, dividing the ESCs into geographical areas: north, middle, and south. This allowed the ESC service providers to meet weekly to discuss their work and share ideas on how to better serve the job seekers and the factories. The project was able to meet its target for providing employment services despite the Covid-19 pandemic.

The BWJ team reported that they were busier during the shutdown receiving more calls than usual from the factories anxious to find out when they would be allowed to reopen. When production restarted, the BWJ Team continued to conduct their work and collect information by phone and email. The Covid-19 shutdown taught the Team that advisory and hybrid assessments could be done

effectively virtually. The informants found that an e-inspection platform could be useful and relevant to the work of the Enterprise Assessors and the Labour Inspectors. The Evaluation concluded that the Covid-19 did not affect the Project in an important manner.

Impact Orientation

Outcome 1: The Evaluation found that ILO has led Outcome 1 with little participation and collaboration from its principal stakeholder, the MOL. The Evaluation found that there was no interaction between ILO and the stakeholders nor had stakeholders collaborated in the project activities. The Evaluation concluded that there was no commitment from the stakeholders including the MOL to Outcome 1.

Outcome 2: BWJ, established in 2009, is very prominent in the Jordanian garment industry; it maintains a strong relationship and partnership with the MOL. BWJ, and the stakeholders agreed to create a separate Project Advisory Committee (PAC) for the non-garment sectors similar to the PAC for the garment industry. The Evaluation is of the opinion that a strong collaboration between ILO, the MOITS and the various stakeholders including the Jordan Chamber of Commerce, the Jordan Export can well promote interest and registration in the RoO program among the companies in the targeted sectors. The Evaluation agreed that the creation of a separate PAC for non-garment factories was a good decision.

Sustainability

The Evaluation did not find that ILO had designed specific exit plans for this EU/ILO project Outcome 1 and Outcome 2. The Project Team reported that ILO held a workshop on June 2022, under the title “Sustainability of Employment Services in Jordan” in which the sustainability plan for employment services and employment offices was discussed. In addition, ILO has drafted a concept paper on the sustainability of employment services in Jordan. The Project Team has explained that Better Work Jordan Phase IV strategy includes detailed plans for the BWJ programming to exit Jordan. However, these are not specifics regarding the EU/ILO project. Furthermore, for Outcome 1, the Evaluation did not find that ILO has established strong collaboration with the stakeholders to safeguard the achievements of the EU/ILO Project and sustainability. The Evaluation agreed with the informants that this project will not be able to continue unless financing from the EU is renewed and/or other donors found.

In 2022, BWJ has started to engage the stakeholders proactively, which the Evaluation found can contribute to the sustainability of Outcome 2 in the long term. Nevertheless, the Ministry of Labour has yet to take ownership of the training of the Labour Inspectors and there were no indications that BWJ is discussing the future of this component of the program with its counterpart.

Effectiveness of management arrangements

Outcome 1: ILO signed an agreement first with the National Employment and Training Company (NET) on April 1st, 2020; on November 6th, 2022, it started a new contract with the General Federation of Jordanian Trade Unions (GFJTU) to run the ESCs. The ESC service providers are subcontracted by these implementing partners, but the staff is not happy with this arrangement. The ESC service providers are dissatisfied with their working conditions, citing the absence of job security and clearly spelled-out employment agreements in their contract with the subcontractor.

Additional Information shared by other stakeholders that was not considered in the report include: *"ESC staff were given the option to become employees of GFJTU and follow the compensation scale and working hours. However, they chose to remain service providers to GFJTU to enjoy the flexibility of working hours and receive better compensation. Their current compensation as service providers is almost double of what they might receive as GFJTU employees"*.

They would like ILO to ensure that the subcontractor in charge of staffing the ESCs follow the labour laws and implements decent work conditions in their workplaces.

The evaluators explained that this statement is general: *"ILO may just well find that the laws are being followed. There is no accusation that GFJTU is not following the rules."*

The informants explained that the lines of reporting are ill-defined causing confusion on the management roles and responsibilities of ILO and the subcontractor at the ESCs. Morale is low among the employees in part caused by the uncertainty around the renewal of the EU/ILO Project which will impact their job and future. The Evaluation found that there should be better communication between ILO management and its staff⁴ as well as accountability and transparency in the workplace.

There has been an allegation of sexual misconduct at the workplace by one ESC service providers member. The Project Team reported to the Evaluators that the incident has been investigated by the ILO Audit and Investigation Unit (AIU) as per the high standards of the organization in such situation. The Evaluator was briefed by the ILO's Chief Internal Auditor who confirmed that an investigation was undertaken into allegations of sexual exploitation allegations

⁴ The evaluation team were requested to clarify that ESC subcontractors are not considered ILO staff. Therefore this sentence should read, "The evaluation found that there should be better communication between ILO management and subcontractors..."

and appropriate actions were taken once the investigation was complete.

ILO Evaluation Office notes that in light of the audit investigation that took place, a paragraph pertaining to allegations of sexual misconduct and its outcome has been deleted from this report. A full report was produced by the IAO and shared with the evaluation team.

Outcome 2: The Evaluation found that BWJ has hired very qualified people for the Outcome 2 Team. The Enterprise Assessors are experienced in providing the core services to the garment factories. The Evaluation found that this experienced team have largely contributed to the capacity building of the MOL Labour Inspectors.

RECOMMENDATIONS, LESSONS LEARNED AND GOOD PRACTICES

Main findings & Conclusions

The Evaluation has performed an in-depth analysis of the information collected and considered the socio-economic and political situation of the country as well as the cultural beliefs as well as the challenges that jobseekers face in current labour market. The Evaluation highly valued the willingness of the informants to share their knowledge and opinion about the project freely.

The evaluation concluded that this project is relevant to the Jordanian context. However, the Jordan's economy has been struggling with persistently sluggish growth dynamics and structural challenges even prior to the COVID-19 crisis. The current unfavorable global context poses further risks to the country and this EU/ILO Project. The Evaluation found that it will become more challenging to match and place jobseekers to jobs. In addition, it found that it will be necessary to implement other activities that will keep the ESCs open to support jobseekers and prepare them for the jobs when the economy recovers and when the Jordanians companies start exporting to the EU under the RoO program.

The Evaluators are of the opinion that ILO and the Project should examine and explore the modernization of the ESCs with the Ministry of Labour, the ILO's Programme of Support, other agencies, as well as the donors that are responding to the Syrian crisis to support economic growth, job creation and quality service delivery in Jordan. The Project should learn from previous and current ILO projects and from other agencies forging partnerships within and outside of ILO.

The Evaluation found that the BWJ performed its work effectively on this Project. It is however important that BWJ become more active in participating in the promotion of the RoO program and that it plans an exit strategy for Outcome 2.

The Evaluation was not able to explain the rationale behind combining two different projects under one agreement and budget. It concluded that there were no reasons to keep these two projects under the same agreement, especially when Outcome 1 and Outcome 2 are managed independently. In fact, the Evaluation found that for the sake of clarity and transparency, Outcome 1 and Outcome 2 should be conducted under separate agreements. In the current financial reporting, it is not possible to distinguish between Outcome 1 and Outcome 2 expenditures.

The evaluation concluded that this project is relevant to the Jordanian context, and consistent with the principles of the ILO Decent Work Country Programmes (DWCP) and the P&B. The activities are contributing to the achievement of the targets of SDG 8 and the EU. The Project, the donor and the stakeholders should however develop Theory of Change for Outcome 1 and Outcome 2 separately, identifying the output and outcomes which will make a difference in

	<p>the economy and the livelihood of Jordanians and Syrian refugees. Exit strategies should also be designed and planned for the two projects. The Project Team indicated that the MOL capacity building activities of the EU/ILO project faced challenges in terms of number of activities in addition to staff turnover, lack of capacity and resistance to change on the part of the MOL management.</p> <p>The Evaluation would like to stress the importance of carrying out baseline, mid-term and endline evaluations for projects. This Final Evaluation has uncovered several issues with the Project which could have been identified and corrected at earlier stages of its lifecycle. The Evaluators believe that this Project could have achieved better results had earlier evaluations been performed.</p>
<p>Main lessons learned and good practices</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To obtain a job, it is essential that the Syrian refugee obtains a work permit; however, the person faces several challenges in the Jordanian labour market including competition between Syrians and Jordanians. Since the job market is unstable and challenging, some prefer to stay in a social assistance program that provides some security while in some cases, they may choose to work in the informal sector at the same time. - ILO and BWJ may have drafted an exit strategy for the sustainability of its projects, but this does not dispense the EU/ILO Outcome 1 and Outcome 2 from making plans with its stakeholders on how the EU/ILO Outcome 1 and Outcome 2 Project can continue without loss of achievements obtained through funding from the EU. - Good management practices and communication, clear lines of supervision as well as respect for colleagues are essential for the ESCs or any project for that matter. <p>The capacity-building training for the Labour Inspectors was provided in three stages. It has allowed the project and MOL to identify the best candidates for the job. The inspectors who had the BWJ EAs as mentors and models now understand that a collaborative and constructive approach instead of a confrontational and policing attitude is more productive when assessing the work environment of factories. The Labour Inspectors who participated in this study are proud of their role and job. The Evaluation found that training programs consisted of coaching, mentoring and hands-on practice are constructive.</p>
<p>Recommendations⁵</p>	<p>Outcome 1 and Outcome 2 - Recommendation #1: The project Logic Model is reviewed and redrawn.</p> <p>The Evaluation found that the objectives of the EU/ILO Project are valid; nevertheless, it recommends that the Logic Model be redrawn for Outcome 1 and Outcome 2 and that additional quantitative as well</p>

⁵ The recommendations phrasing does not conform with EVAL's quality- see guidance provided to consultant but not followed: https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_746729.pdf

as qualitative indicators be identified for more effective monitoring and measurements of project progress and performance.

Outcome 1 - Recommendation #2: The E-Counselling Platform is assessed and fixed.

The Evaluation has received contradictory feedback for the E-Counselling platform. ESC service providers, jobseekers and factories find that the system is not user-friendly. Although the Project Team is using data generated by the E-Counselling Platform for reporting, the Evaluators strongly recommend an assessment and enhancement of this platform.

Outcome 1 and Outcome 2 - Recommendation #3: The monitoring system is overhauled.

The Evaluation found that for both Outcomes, the monitoring system fails to report indicators that are necessary for measuring the project performance. These should include both quantitative (numbers and percentage) and qualitative (e.g., level of satisfaction) as well as Project targets. The Project Team indicated that the quantitative and qualitative indicators were identified from templates provided by the EU. Nevertheless, the Evaluation recommends that ILO reviews the monitoring system for this project with relevant and informative indicators to assess the performance of the EU/ILO project more effectively and on a continuous basis.

Outcome 1 - Recommendation #4: Review the Outcome 1 management practices and outsourcing.

The Evaluation recommends that ILO improves its communication strategy with its staff, partners, and stakeholders for transparency. It recommends greater collaboration with the ROAS for management and technical support. It is also recommended that the implementing partners be monitored closely to ensure the creation of decent work in healthy environments as per the ILO mandate within its projects including this EU/ILO project. The Evaluation recommends that the roles and responsibilities, and the lines of reporting be clearly defined for ILO, the service providers, and the ESC service providers. This recommendation is in line with the recommendation of the Report of the Chief Internal Auditor for the year ended 31 December 2022⁶.

Outcome 2 - Recommendation #5: Undertake situational analysis of non-garment enterprises.

The Evaluation recommends that ILO works in closer collaboration and design the study in a participatory manner with the Jordan Chamber of Industry and the enterprises especially in the non-garment industries to better understand their challenges and find solutions for access to the EU market and recommendations for the growth of the

⁶ [Report of the Chief Internal Auditor for the year ended 31 December 2022 \(ilo.org\)](#)

Paragraph 8 page 8; Paragraph 48, first bullet point page 19.

companies and the industries. This joint effort will build a closer rapport between BWJ and the stakeholders.

Outcome 2 - Recommendation #6: Outcome 2 becomes a stand-alone project known as collaboration between BWJ and the EU.

The Evaluation found that several stakeholders associate ILO with the labour market only; they do not see ILO having a role to play in the growth of an industry. The activities of Outcome 2 are within the scope of the deliverables of BWJ; however, it is not within the ILO mandate to organize commercial events as suggested by the stakeholders. The Evaluation recommends that the renaming of Outcome 2 to the EU/BWJ project with its own budget.
